City	of	York	Council	
------	----	------	---------	--

Committee Minutes

MEETING HUNGATE AD HOC SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

DATE 18 NOVEMBER 2008

PRESENT COUNCILLORS ASPDEN (CHAIR), BROOKS,

GUNNELL, HOLVEY, PIERCE AND TAYLOR (NON-

**VOTING CO-OPTED MEMBER)** 

**APOLOGIES** 

#### 1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

At this point members were invited to declare any personal or prejudicial interests they might have in the business of the agenda. No interests were declared.

# 2. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

# 3. HUNGATE DEVELOPMENT AD-HOC SCRUTINY REVIEW SCOPING REPORT

Members considered a Scoping Report, which presented suggestions on how they might proceed with the scrutiny review of the Hungate Development. The report set out a proposed timetable and method for progressing the review and asked members to identify who they would like to invite to the consultation session and to agree a list of questions to be asked.

In response to a request from the Chair, Cllr Brooks, who had proposed the topic for scrutiny, outlined the main reasons why the matter had been registered for scrutiny and referred to information provided in the Scrutiny Topic Registration Form.

Members then raised a number of issues and questions for the scrutiny committee to discuss, including requests for more information. These included questions about:

- The ownership of the project, decision-making, risk management issues, the architects plans.
- The Hungate site, early decisions with regard to the site, council land ownership at the site, and the size of the site.
- The consultation process, including early public soundings and who was consulted.

- The withdrawal decision with regard to Hungate.
- The budget for the project and when it had changed.
- The lessons that could be learned.

The Scrutiny Officer circulated a sheet that listed the various bodies that had been consulted in the process.

The Chair asked Members if they had seen the documents from English Heritage. As Members had not, the Chair asked that the two letters from English Heritage be circulated. 4

The photocopied quality of certain confidential background papers in the information pack, which had been circulated to Members when the scrutiny committee had been formed, made it difficult for them to be read. It was agreed that these sheets would be recopied and circulated to members before the next meeting. <sup>3</sup>

# Members confirmed that they would like to invite the following to the half-day consultation event:

- Accommodation Project Officers
- Planning Officer
- The Council's Conservation Officer
- Risk Management Officer
- A Finance Office
- English Heritage
- Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE)

It was noted that the scheduled half-day informal consultation event included on the timetable was not a public meeting. It was also confirmed that the findings from the event would be presented in a publicly available report at the next formal meeting of the Committee on 10 December 2008. The Chair asked for clarification from Human Resources and the Legal Department with regard to the question of Officers speaking freely on this scrutiny matter. <sup>2</sup>

# **RESOLVED**

- i. That the content of the scrutiny report and the information pack, previously circulated to Members, be noted.
- ii. That the consultation process and the timetable for the scrutiny review as outlined in the timetable in paragraph 8 of the agenda be agreed.
- iii. That questions and points for clarification during the scrutiny procedure be agreed as noted above.
- iv. That Officers and representatives from outside organisations, as detailed above, be invited to attend the informal half-day

consultation event on the 26 November, and possibly also be invited to attend the meeting on 10 December if required. <sup>1</sup>

#### **REASON**

To progress this review in line with the timeframe agreed for the review and to ensure compliance with scrutiny procedures, protocols and work plans.

### **Action Required**

- 1. Scrutiny Officer to contact the various officers and outside GR bodies and request their attendance at the informal half-day consultation event on 26 November 2008.
- 2. Scrutiny Officer to clarify with HR and Legal Services with GR regard to Officers being able to speak freely on this scrutiny matter.
- 3. Scrutiny Officer to arrange for the re-photocopying of the GR few report pages which were unclear and circulate these to Members.
- 4. Scrutiny Officer to circulate the two English Heritage GR letters pertaining to this matter to Members for the next meeting.

Councillor Aspden, Chair [The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 6.05 pm].